

# Review of Government Advertising

## Review of Government Advertising

The government of Ontario is a major Canadian advertiser, spending tens of millions of dollars each year to place advertisements on television, radio, the Internet, billboards and in newspapers and magazines.

The *Government Advertising Act, 2004* (Act) took effect in December 2005 after two years of debate in the Legislature—and several years of discussion prior to that—as legislators questioned the appropriateness of a government spending public funds on advertising that could be considered to further its partisan interests.

The main intent of the Act is to prohibit government advertising that could be seen as promoting the governing party’s political interests by fostering a positive impression of the government or a negative impression of any group or person critical of the government. The Act mandates the Auditor General to review and approve most government advertisements before they run to ensure that they comply with the Act’s prohibition on partisan advertising and its other standards. The full text of the Act can be found at [www.e-laws.gov.on.ca](http://www.e-laws.gov.on.ca).

This chapter satisfies the legislative requirements in the Act as well as in the *Auditor General Act* to report annually to the Legislative Assembly on the work we have done over the past fiscal year to ensure adherence to the Act.

## Overview of the Advertising Review Function

Under the Act, the Auditor General is responsible for reviewing specified types of government advertisements to ensure they meet legislated standards. Above all, they must not contain anything that is, or could be interpreted as being, primarily partisan in nature.

The Act outlines standards each advertisement must meet and states that “an item is partisan if, in the opinion of the Auditor General, a primary objective of the item is to promote the partisan political interests of the governing party.”

The Act also provides the Auditor General with the discretionary authority to consider additional factors in determining whether a primary objective of an item is to promote the partisan interests of the governing party (see the “Other Factors” section later in this chapter).

### WHAT FALLS UNDER THE ACT

The Act applies to advertisements that government offices—specifically, government ministries, Cabinet Office and the Office of the Premier—propose to pay to have published in a newspaper or magazine, displayed on a billboard, or broadcast on radio or television. It also applies to printed matter that a government office proposes to pay to have distributed to households in Ontario using

unaddressed bulk mail or another method of bulk delivery. Advertisements meeting any of these definitions are known as “reviewable” items and must be submitted to my Office for review and approval before they can run.

The Act excludes from review job advertisements and notices to the public required by law. Advertisements on the provision of goods and services to a government office, and those on urgent matters affecting public health or safety, are also excluded.

Although the following are not specifically excluded, we have come to a mutual understanding with the government that they are not subject to the Act:

- online advertising; and
- brochures, newsletters, consultation documents, reports and other similar materials or publications.

The Act requires government offices to submit every reviewable item to our Office. The government office cannot publish, display, broadcast, distribute or disseminate the submitted item until the head of that office, usually the deputy minister, receives notice, or is deemed to have received notice, that the advertisement has been approved.

The Auditor General’s Office, by regulation, has seven business days to render its decision. If we do not give notice within this time, the government office is deemed to have received notice that the item meets the standards of the Act, and the item may be run.

If my Office notifies the government office that the item does not meet the standards, the item may not be used. However, the government office may submit a revised version of the rejected item for another review. As with the first submission, my Office has seven days to render a decision. Under the Act, all decisions of the Auditor General are final.

Approval of an advertisement is valid for one year, although my Office can rescind an approval if we determine that new circumstances leave the impression that the ad has become partisan.

A pre-review is also available to government offices wishing us to examine an early version of an ad. This can be a script or storyboard, provided that it reasonably reflects the item as it is intended to appear when completed. Pre-reviews help limit the time and money spent to develop ads containing material that could be deemed objectionable under the Act. A pre-review is strictly voluntary on our part and is outside the statutory requirements of the Act.

If material submitted for pre-review appears to violate the Act, we provide an explanation to the government office. If it appears to meet the standards of the Act, we so advise the government office. However, before the advertisement can be used, the government office must submit it in finished form so we can review it to ensure that it still meets the standards of the Act.

## STANDARDS FOR PROPOSED ADVERTISEMENTS

In conducting its review, the Auditor General’s Office determines whether the proposed advertisement meets the standards of the Act, which are:

- The item must be a reasonable means of achieving one or more of the following objectives:
  - to inform the public of current or proposed government policies, programs or services;
  - to inform the public of its rights and responsibilities under the law;
  - to encourage or discourage specific social behaviour in the public interest; and/or
  - to promote Ontario, or any part of the province, as a good place to live, work, invest, study or visit, or to promote any economic activity or sector of Ontario’s economy.
- The item must include a statement that it is paid for by the government of Ontario.
- The item must not include the name, voice or image of a member of the Executive Council (cabinet) or a member of the Legislative Assembly (unless the primary target audience

is located outside Ontario, in which case the item is exempt from this requirement).

- The item must not have a primary objective of fostering a positive impression of the governing party, or a negative impression of a person or entity critical of the government.
- The item must not be partisan; that is, in the opinion of the Auditor General, it cannot have as a primary objective the promotion of the partisan interests of the governing party.

## OTHER FACTORS

In addition to the specific statutory standards above, the Act allows the Auditor General to consider additional factors to determine whether a primary objective of an item is to promote the partisan interests of the governing party. In general, these additional factors relate to the overall impression conveyed by the ad and how it is likely to be perceived. Consideration is given to whether it includes certain desirable attributes and avoids certain undesirable ones, as follows:

- Each item should:
  - contain subject matter relevant to government responsibilities (that is, the government should have direct and substantial responsibilities for the specific matters dealt with in the item);
  - present information objectively, in tone and content, with facts expressed clearly and accurately, using unbiased and objective language;
  - emphasize facts and/or explanations, rather than the political merits of proposals; and
  - enable the audience to distinguish between fact on the one hand and comment, opinion or analysis on the other.
- Items should not:
  - use colours, logos and/or slogans commonly associated with the governing party;
  - inappropriately personalize (for instance, by attacking opponents or critics);

- directly or indirectly attack, ridicule, criticize or rebut the views, policies or actions of those critical of the government;
- intentionally promote, or be perceived as promoting, political-party interests (to this end, consideration is also given to the timing of the message, the audience it is aimed at and the overall environment in which the message will be communicated);
- deliver self-congratulatory or image-building messages;
- deal with matters such as a policy proposal where no decision has been made, unless the item provides a balanced explanation of both the benefits and the disadvantages;
- present pre-existing policies, products, services or activities as if they were new; or
- use a uniform resource locator (URL) to direct readers, viewers or listeners to a web page with content that may not meet the standards of the Act (see “Websites” in the following section).

## OTHER REVIEW PROTOCOLS

Since taking on responsibility for the review of government advertising, my Office has tried to clarify, in co-operation with government offices, areas where the Act is silent. What follows is a brief description of the main areas that have required clarification over the years.

### Websites

Although websites are not specifically reviewable under the Act, we believe that a website, Quick Response Code or similar linkage used in an advertisement is an extension of the ad. Following discussions with the government in 2005, we came to an agreement that the first page, or “click,” of a website cited in a reviewable item would be included in our review. We consider only the content of the first click, unless that first click is a gateway page, in which case we review the next page. We examine

this page for any content that may not meet the standards of the Act. For example, the page must not include a minister's name or photo, any self-congratulatory messages or any content that attacks the policies or opinions of others.

### Third-party Advertising

Government funds provided to third parties are sometimes used for advertising. The government and my Office have agreed that third-party advertising must be submitted for review if it meets all three of the following criteria:

- a government office provides the third party with funds intended to pay part or all of the cost of publishing, displaying, broadcasting or distributing the item;
- the government grants the third party permission to use the Ontario logo or another official provincial visual identifier in the item; and
- the government office approves the content of the item.

### Social Media

Social media was in its infancy when the Act came into effect in 2005. However, its use has grown exponentially in recent years. This year, for the first time, our Office received ads for approval with icons pointing to the government's presence on social-media sites. Although the Act is silent on this, we reached an agreement with the government that our Office will perform an initial scan of any social-media channel cited in an ad to ensure that there are no partisan references. However, we recognize that content on these networks changes frequently and can at times be beyond the control of the government office.

### Event/Conference Program Advertisements

Government advertisements sometimes appear in programs and other materials distributed at public events such as conferences and trade shows. Our

Office took the view that these ads should be subject to the Act because they serve a purpose similar to magazines and other print media. Often, these ads are run free of charge because the government has financially sponsored the event. We therefore consider that the government indirectly paid for the "free" advertisement. The government has agreed with this approach, and these items must be submitted for review.

### Government Recruitment Advertisements

As previously noted, the Act excludes job advertisements from review. We have interpreted this exemption as applying to advertising for specific government jobs, but not to broad-ranging generic recruitment campaigns. The government has agreed with our interpretation and, as a result, generic recruitment campaigns must be submitted to my Office for review.

## External Advisers

Under the *Auditor General Act*, the Auditor General can appoint an Advertising Commissioner to help to fulfill the requirements of the *Government Advertising Act, 2004*. Instead, my Office has engaged a number of external advisers to assist us in the review of submissions. The following advisers provided services to my Office during the 2011/12 fiscal year:

- Rafe Engle (J.D., L.L.M.) is a Toronto lawyer specializing in advertising, marketing, communications and entertainment law for a diverse group of clients in the for-profit and not-for-profit sectors. He also acts as the outside legal counsel for Advertising Standards Canada, and as Chair of its Advertising Standards Council. Before studying law, Mr. Engle acquired a comprehensive background in media, advertising and communications while working in the advertising industry.

- Jonathan Rose is Associate Professor of Political Studies at Queen’s University. He is a leading Canadian academic with interests in political advertising and Canadian politics. Professor Rose has written a book on government advertising in Canada and a number of articles on the way in which political parties and governments use advertising.
- Joel Ruimy is a communications consultant with three decades of experience as a journalist, editor and producer covering Ontario and national politics in print and television.
- John Sciarra is the former director of operations in my Office. He was instrumental in implementing our advertising review function and overseeing our review responsibilities until his retirement in 2010.

These advisers provided valuable assistance in our review of government advertising this past year.

## Advertising Review Activity, 2011/12

### RESULTS OF OUR REVIEWS

During the 2011/12 fiscal year, we reviewed 565 individual advertising items in 121 final submissions, with a total value of \$34.8 million. This includes 38 ads, worth \$202,000, that had not been submitted to our Office for review, but should have been. This compares to 165 submissions, comprising 1,082 individual ads, with a total value of more than \$50 million last year.

We gave our decision within the required seven business days in all cases. The length of time required for a review and decision can vary, depending on the complexity of the ad and on other work priorities. Nevertheless, the average turnaround time during the past fiscal year was 3.2 business days.

We also examined eight pre-review submissions that contained 11 ads at a preliminary stage of

development. Because pre-reviews are voluntary on our part and outside the statutory requirements of the Act, they are second in priority to finished items. We nonetheless make every effort to complete them within a reasonable time. The average turnaround time for these submissions was 5.6 business days.

Of all the final submissions received in the 2011/12 fiscal year, we found two in violation:

- A radio campaign promoting the availability of free vaccinations for the rotavirus was rejected because it loosely resembled a Liberal Party of Ontario commercial that ran prior to the 2011 election on the medical screening of newborn infants. The Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care subsequently reworked the ad and resubmitted it, and we approved it.
- A print and radio campaign about agricultural risk-management programs was rejected because it violated section 6(1)5 of the Act, which says that an ad must not have as a primary objective to “foster a positive impression of the governing party.” After quickly reworking the campaign, the Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs resubmitted it and we approved it.

We also rescinded approval for three digital video and television ads that were part of a Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care campaign on medical wait times after the Liberal Party of Ontario released an ad with strikingly similar visuals on the same subject prior to the 2011 election.

We also cited the Ministry of Finance for a violation of the Act after we found that the campaign for Ontario Savings Bonds, which we had earlier approved, contained a change to the approved web page that included a reference to the “McGuinty government.” This contravenes section 6(1)3 of the Act, which says ads “must not include the name, voice or image of a member of the Executive Council or a member of the Assembly.” The Ministry quickly corrected it.

We also noted contraventions of the Act—advertisements that ran without having first been submitted to us for review. They are as follows:

- The Ministry of the Attorney General advised us that it ran an ad in a publication for lawyers about a new mailing address for the Office of the Children’s Lawyer without first submitting it for review. Had the ad been submitted, our Office would have approved it.
- The Ministry of Community and Social Services advised us that it had run an ad over the last six years about ministry services available to Toronto’s francophone community without first submitting it for review. Had the ad been submitted, our Office would have approved it.
- The Ministry of Economic Development and Innovation advised us that its advertising agency inadvertently released an ad for publication although it had not yet been submitted to our Office for review. This ad was part of a large international campaign whose other elements were submitted to and approved by our Office. The Ministry and agency advised us they have since adopted new procedures to ensure this does not happen again. The ad in question was subsequently submitted and approved by our Office.
- We discovered through our expenditure-gathering process that the Ministry of Natural Resources ran 34 radio ads that it did not submit to our Office for review. The Ministry explained that these ads were about urgent matters regarding forest fires and therefore exempt from review under subsection 2(5) of the Act. We reviewed the ads and determined that 12 of them did not qualify for the exemption as they focused on fire prevention which, in our opinion, did not meet the intent of the Act with respect to the exclusion of urgent messages. While our Office prefers to be notified prior to the government running an ad on an urgent matter, it may not always be practical. We have therefore established an urgent-advertising process with the Ministry,

whereby our Office will be provided copies on a monthly basis of any urgent-advertising run.

- The Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport ran 23 ads in various media about Huronia Historical Parks and Fort William Historical Park without first submitting them to our Office. These attractions are part of the Ministry and therefore covered by the Act. These contraventions occurred in April, May and June 2011. Since we raised this issue with the Ministry in July 2011, it has been submitting such advertising for review.

## OTHER MATTERS

### Online Advertising

Online advertising has become an integral part of most marketing campaigns. Many of the government’s large advertising campaigns include an online component and some campaigns even run entirely online. The Act does not cover online advertising. In the past, we have seen government online campaigns that would have been in violation of the Act if they had been submitted to our Office for review. In the 2011/12 fiscal year, the government spent more on Internet advertising than it did for advertising on television (excluding production costs). As the government’s online advertising increases, we believe its exemption has become a significant loophole in the legislation that should be addressed if the intent of the Act is to be met for all government advertising. Our expenditure reporting at the end of this chapter does not include any Internet costs. We believe the time has come for the government to amend the Act to include Internet advertising.

### Revised Government Advertising Guidelines

In the fall, our Office released updated Advertising Review Guidelines. The revised Guidelines provide government offices with an overview of the Act,

explain our processes for submitting advertisements for review, and provide clarification on certain sections of the Act. They also reflect evolving practices adopted since the Act took effect seven years ago. We have posted the Guidelines on our website to provide ready access to staff in government offices.

## Expenditures on Advertisements and Printed Matter

The *Auditor General Act* requires that the Auditor General report annually to the Legislative Assembly on expenditures for advertisements and printed matter reviewable under the *Government Advertising Act, 2004*.

Figure 1 contains expenditure details of advertising campaigns reported to us by each ministry. In order to test the completeness and accuracy of the reported advertising expenditures, my Office reviewed selected payments to suppliers of advertising and creative services and their supporting documentation at selected ministries. We also performed certain compliance procedures with respect to the requirements of sections 2, 3, 4 and 8 of the *Government Advertising Act, 2004*. These deal with submission requirements and prohibition on the use of items pending the Auditor General's review. We found no matters of concern in our review work.

**Figure 1: Expenditures for Reviewable Advertisements and Printed Matter under the Government Advertising Act, 2004, April 1, 2011–March 31, 2012**

Source of data: Ontario government offices

Ministry/Campaign Title	# of Submissions	# of Items	Third-party Costs (\$)				
			Agency Fees	Production	Talent	Bulk Mail	Other
<b>Aboriginal Affairs</b>							
Infrastructure Signs	2	22	–	2,038	–	–	–
<b>Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs</b>							
Foodland Ontario <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Good Things Grow in Ontario	4	64	177,623	109,286	227,789	–	158
Invest in Ontario <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Risk Management Programs <sup>4</sup>	2	12	–	–	–	–	–
<b>Attorney General</b>							
Notice to the Legal Profession	1	1	–	–	–	–	–
Notice to the Legal Profession <sup>3</sup>	–	1	–	–	–	–	–
<b>Citizenship and Immigration</b>							
Global Experience Ontario	2	2	–	–	–	–	40
Order of Ontario	1	23	3,488	–	–	–	220
Remembrance Day	1	8	1,111	–	–	–	184
<b>Community and Social Services</b>							
Social Service Contact Numbers <sup>3</sup>	–	1	–	–	–	–	–
<b>Community Safety and Correctional Services</b>							
Arrive Alive	1	1	–	–	–	–	–
Cyber Safety	1	1	–	18,000	–	–	–
RIDE <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
RIDE <sup>2</sup>	1	8	–	–	27,415	–	612
<b>Economic Development and Trade</b>							
Business Immigration	3	13	13,912	3,400	–	–	401
Business Immigration <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Go North <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–340	959	–	–	191
Invest Ontario	4	26	54,629	3,146	6,000	–	17
Invest Ontario <sup>1</sup>	–	–	100,194	5,892	6,000	–	4,492
Ontario Exports	1	1	528	–	–	–	–
Ontario Exports <sup>1</sup>	–	–	11,106	72	–	–	–
Your Next Big Idea <sup>2</sup>	3	27	569,148	236,917	–	–	520
Your Next Big Idea <sup>6</sup>	1	1	–	–	–	–	–
<b>Education</b>							
Full-day Kindergarten	2	13	15,443	9,686	30,422	–	–
Full-day Kindergarten <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–

1. Reported in 2011, but more costs in 2012.

2. Reported in 2012, but more costs in 2013.

3. Contravention—ad was not submitted for review, but reported by Ministry.

4. Violation—ad was reviewed, but did not meet the required standards, then resubmitted and approved.

6. Contravention—ad was published before being reviewed, then submitted and approved.



TV	Media Costs (\$)			Ad Value† (\$)	Campaign Total (\$)
	Radio	Print	Out-of-Home*		
–	–	–	–	–	2,038
2,954,708	329	–	20,581	–	2,975,618
322,181	740,793	380,823	517,474	–	2,476,127
–	–	7,938	–	–	7,938
–	92,648	40,163	–	–	132,811
–	–	1,827	–	–	1,827
–	–	3,574	–	–	3,574
–	–	1,250	–	248	1,538
–	–	140,582	–	–	144,290
–	–	30,174	–	–	31,469
–	–	2,052	–	–	2,052
–	–	1,831	–	–	1,831
55,334	–	–	–	–	73,334
-367	–	–	–	–	-367 <sup>a</sup>
108,055	–	–	–	–	136,082
12,463	–	30,683	–	–	60,859
–	–	-10,202	–	–	-10,202 <sup>a</sup>
–	–	-5,077	–	500	-3,767 <sup>a</sup>
–	–	122,330	–	–	186,122
-1,941	–	71,910	–	–	186,547
–	–	–	–	5,500	6,028
–	–	11,439	–	–	22,617
–	–	5,125,369	336,034	–	6,267,988
–	–	–	–	–	–
953,954	–	–	–	–	1,009,505
-17,728	–	940	–	–	-16,788 <sup>a</sup>

\* Out-of-Home advertising includes, for example, billboards and transit posters.

† Ad Value denotes the value of an ad space provided to government offices at no cost, often where the government has provided funding for a related event.

a. Negative total due to media credits being applied.

Ministry/Campaign Title	# of Submissions	# of Items	Third-party Costs (\$)				
			Agency Fees	Production	Talent	Bulk Mail	Other
<b>Energy</b>							
Long-term Energy Plan <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
<b>Environment</b>							
Protecting Ontario's Drinking Water	1	1	–	–	–	–	–
<b>Finance</b>							
Children's Activity Tax Credit <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Ontario Budget <sup>1</sup>	–	–	6,525	13,775	–	–	3,115
Ontario Savings Bonds <sup>7</sup>	3	32	403,260	491,638	92,414	–	10,465
<b>Government Services</b>							
Licence Plate Sticker Renewal	2	3	4,720	14,137	9,046	–	–
Postal Strike	1	2	–	–	–	–	771
ServiceOntario <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
ServiceOntario Brand Awareness	3	32	165,012	493,875	46,287	–	3,708
ServiceOntario Offices	3	7	–	–	–	–	60
ServiceOntario Offices <sup>2</sup>	1	4	–	–	–	–	–
<b>Health and Long-Term Care</b>							
Breast Cancer Screening Expansion	3	24	–	77,863	–	–	18
Diabetes	4	28	–	2,300	–	–	4,000
Health Care Options	1	11	2,756	–	–	–	3,252
Health Care Options <sup>5</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Health Care Options <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Healthy Smiles Ontario	1	2	5,270	197,874	–	–	–
Immunization – Rotavirus Vaccine <sup>4</sup>	2	4	4,250	8,590	9,625	–	567
MedsCheck for Diabetes Patients <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Public Information Session	1	1	350	1,010	1,000	–	50
Seasonal Flu	4	25	43,478	83,295	121,260	–	1,961
Seasonal Flu <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Stroke Warning Signs <sup>2</sup>	2	2	7,235	25,241	–	–	3,417
Trillium Gift of Life Network	4	18	79,231	312,430	82,628	–	3,102
<b>Health Promotion and Sport</b>							
Diabetes <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
World Junior Baseball <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
<b>Labour</b>							
Safe at Work Ontario	1	1	–	–	–	–	–
Employment Standards <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–

1. Reported in 2011, but more costs in 2012.

2. Reported in 2012, but more costs in 2013.

4. Violation—ad was reviewed, but did not meet the required standards, then resubmitted and approved.

5. Reported in 2011, but more costs in 2012—approval withdrawn.

7. Changes to the website after approval violated the Act, then corrected by Ministry.

	Media Costs (\$)				Ad Value† (\$)	Campaign Total (\$)
	TV	Radio	Print	Out-of-Home*		
	488,492	1,218,136	–	–	–	1,706,628
	–	–	–	–	100	100
	–	-2,077	264,334	–	–	262,257
	–	–	–	–	–	23,415
	791,971	157,326	671,932	–	–	2,619,006
	–	9,865	8,742	6,037	–	52,547
	–	–	93,932	–	–	94,703
	–	–	17	–	–	17
	1,569,587	–	361,306	–	–	2,639,775
	–	–	5,416	–	–	5,476
	–	–	–	–	–	–
	–	–	764,796	–	–	842,677
	–	–	860,062	–	3,250	869,612
	–	112,022	–	–	–	118,030
	1,583,001	–	–	–	–	1,583,001
	–	–	–	186,614	–	186,614
	–	–	196,912	–	–	400,056
	–	375,880	–	–	–	398,912
	–	-2,379	–	–	–	-2,379 <sup>a</sup>
	–	–	7,511	–	–	9,921
	1,351,051	–	–	271,873	–	1,872,918
	–	5,622	–	–	–	5,622
	–	–	–	–	–	35,893
	1,244,106	–	20,769	1,677,192	–	3,419,458
	–	–	141,082	–	–	141,082
	–	–	–	–	2,400	2,400
	–	–	–	–	1,195	1,195
	–	–	-7,260	–	–	-7,260 <sup>a</sup>

\* Out-of-Home advertising includes, for example, billboards and transit posters.

† Ad Value denotes the value of an ad space provided to government offices at no cost, often where the government has provided funding for a related event.

a. Negative total due to media credits being applied.

Ministry/Campaign Title	# of Submissions	# of Items	Third-party Costs (\$)				
			Agency Fees	Production	Talent	Bulk Mail	Other
<b>Natural Resources</b>							
Advisory Committee Seeks New Members	2	2	–	–	–	–	–
BearWise	1	16	–	5,154	–	–	4,080
FireSmart Wildfire Prevention <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
FireSmart Wildfire Prevention <sup>2</sup>	1	14	–	–	–	–	–
Fish Art Contest	1	1	–	200	–	–	–
Ontario Parks	8	8	–	–	–	–	–
Ontario Parks <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	375	–	–	–
Ontario Parks <sup>2</sup>	2	3	–	–	–	–	–
Outdoors Card Renewal	1	1	–	169	–	–	–
Shoreline Property Notices	2	2	–	–	–	–	–
Species at Risk	1	1	–	–	–	–	–
Wildlife Management	2	2	–	375	–	–	–
Wildfire Prevention <sup>3</sup>	–	12	–	–	–	–	–
<b>Northern Development, Mines and Forestry</b>							
Northern Ontario Energy Credit <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Northern Ontario Heritage Fund <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
<b>Revenue</b>							
Tax Credits <sup>1</sup>	–	–	101,479	91,283	48,254	300,560	18,634
<b>Tourism, Culture and Sport</b>							
Fort William Historical Park	11	20	–	–	–	–	–
Fort William Historical Park <sup>3</sup>	–	16	–	–	–	–	–
Huronian Historical Parks	17	31	–	2,615	–	–	745
Huronian Historical Parks <sup>3</sup>	–	7	–	7,920	–	–	–
<b>Training, Colleges and Universities</b>							
Employment Ontario	2	2	–	–	–	–	–
Post-secondary Awareness and Public Education <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Study in Ontario <sup>2</sup>	1	1	–	–	–	–	–
<b>Transportation</b>							
Drive Safe	1	1	–	–	–	–	–
Veterans Graphic Licence Plates	1	3	8,000	770	6,729	–	–
<b>Total</b>	<b>121</b>	<b>565</b>	<b>1,778,408</b>	<b>2,220,285</b>	<b>714,869</b>	<b>300,560</b>	<b>64,780</b>

1. Reported in 2011, but more costs in 2012.

2. Reported in 2012, but more costs in 2013.

3. Contravention—ad was not submitted for review, but reported by Ministry.

Media Costs (\$)				Ad Value <sup>†</sup> (\$)	Campaign Total (\$)
TV	Radio	Print	Out-of-Home*		
–	–	1,359	–	–	1,359
15,580	–	84,538	6,921	–	116,273
–	–	4,515	–	–	4,515
–	–	–	–	–	–
–	–	–	–	8,350	8,550
–	–	29,758	–	628	30,386
–	–	40,600	–	–	40,975
–	–	–	–	–	–
–	–	–	–	14,560	14,729
–	–	1,506	–	–	1,506
–	–	1,108	–	–	1,108
–	–	–	–	12,860	13,235
–	78,024	–	–	–	78,024
–	102,113	–	–	–	102,113
–	–	–	–	6,024	6,024
1,144,300	–	704,151	–	–	2,408,661
–	8,722	32,739	64,113	–	105,574
–	20,330	67,870	–	–	88,200
35,342	29,918	42,569	–	–	111,189
–	–	1,469	20,650	–	30,039
–	–	–	–	50,000	50,000
-8	–	-10,374	–	–	-10,382 <sup>a</sup>
–	–	15,228	–	1,200	16,428
–	–	5,000	–	–	5,000
535,933	–	10,465	–	–	561,897
<b>13,146,014</b>	<b>2,947,272</b>	<b>10,379,658</b>	<b>3,107,489</b>	<b>106,815</b>	<b>34,766,150</b>

\* Out-of-Home advertising includes, for example, billboards and transit posters.

† Ad Value denotes the value of an ad space provided to government offices at no cost, often where the government has provided funding for a related event.

a. Negative total due to media credits being applied.