

Review of Government Advertising

INTRODUCTION

In reviewing my Office’s activities this past year in regard to the *Government Advertising Act, 2004* (Act), I recalled the words spoken in December 2004 by the then Chair of Management Board, who said, when the Bill was being passed into law: “Every dollar spent on partisan advertising is a dollar wasted—a dollar that doesn’t get spent on providing textbooks for students or reducing waiting times in emergency wards.” He also stated: “The bottom line is that any advertisement deemed by the Auditor General’s Office to promote partisan interests will never see the light of day.” This chapter, which satisfies the legislative requirements in the Act as well as in the *Auditor General Act* to report annually to the Legislative Assembly, outlines the work we have done over the past year to ensure that the principles enunciated by the Chair five years ago are adhered to.

HISTORY

The Act was introduced as Bill 25 at the end of 2003, passed into law the following year, and took effect in December 2005—but was years in the making. As early as the mid-1990s, legislators had expressed concern about the appropriateness of a government’s use of public funds for advertising that could be considered to further partisan inter-

ests. In our *1999 Annual Report*, we raised questions about government advertising of a “party-political nature” and about the appropriateness of the then-government’s use of public funds for certain advertising and communications campaigns. The report noted that Ontario had no “criteria to help distinguish between informative government advertising and party-political advertising.” We suggested that it would be “in the interest of improving public accountability for the government and/or the Legislature as a whole to consider the establishment of principles, guidelines, and criteria that clearly define the nature and characteristics of taxpayer-funded advertising.”

Between 1999 and 2003, four private members’ bills were introduced, each seeking to provide a legislative framework for government advertising. In late 2004, the Legislative Assembly enacted the *Government Advertising Act, 2004* (Act). Its main intent is to prohibit government advertising that may be viewed as promoting the governing party’s political interests by fostering a positive impression of the government or a negative impression of any group or person critical of the government. Under the Act, which can be found at www.e-laws.gov.on.ca, most government advertisements must be submitted to and approved by the Auditor General before they can be used.

Overview of the Advertising Review Function

Under the Act, the Auditor General is responsible for reviewing specified types of government advertising to ensure that they meet legislated standards and that, above all, they do not contain anything that is, or may be interpreted as being, primarily partisan in nature. The Act outlines various standards each advertisement must meet and states that “an item is partisan if, in the opinion of the Auditor General, a primary objective of the item is to promote the partisan political interests of the governing party.” The Act also provides the Auditor General with the discretionary authority to consider additional factors in determining whether a primary objective of an item is to promote the partisan political interests of the governing party (see “Other Factors”).

WHAT FALLS UNDER THE ACT

The Act currently applies to advertisements authorized by government offices—specifically, government ministries, Cabinet Office, and the Office of the Premier. These offices must submit proposed advertising that is subject to the Act to my Office for review and approval before it can be used.

The Act applies to advertisements that government offices will be paying to have published in a newspaper or magazine, displayed on a billboard, or broadcast on radio or television; and to printed matter that a government office proposes to pay to have distributed to households in Ontario either by bulk mail or by another method of bulk delivery. Advertisements meeting any of these definitions—no matter the language—are known as “reviewable” items.

The Act specifically excludes from review any advertisement or printed matter that is a job advertisement or a notice to the public required by law.

Also excluded are advertisements concerning the provision of goods and services to a government office and those regarding an urgent matter affecting public health or safety.

Although the following are not specifically excluded by the Act, we have come to a mutual understanding with the government that they are not subject to the Act:

- electronic advertising on government websites or any public site, except for web pages identified and promoted in a reviewable item (see the Websites subsection later in this chapter); and
- brochures, pamphlets, newsletters, news releases, consultation documents, reports, and other similar printed matter, materials, or publications.

SUBMISSION AND USE OF ADVERTISING ITEMS

Sections 2, 3, 4, and 8 of the Act require that government offices submit every reviewable item to the Auditor General’s Office for review approval. The government office cannot publish, display, broadcast, distribute, or disseminate the submitted item until the head of that office (that is, the deputy minister) receives notice, or is deemed to have received notice, that the advertisement has been approved.

The Auditor General’s Office, by regulation, has seven business days within which to render its decision. If we do not give notice within this time frame, the government office is deemed to have received notice that the item meets the standards of the Act, and it may run the advertisement.

If the head receives notice from my Office that the item does not meet the Act’s standards, the item may not be used. However, the government office may submit a revised version of the rejected item for a further review. As with the first submission, my Office has seven days to render its decision.

Once an item has been approved, a government office may use it for the next 12 months. Under the Act, all decisions of the Auditor General are final.

STANDARDS FOR PROPOSED ADVERTISEMENTS

In conducting its review, the Auditor General's Office first determines whether the proposed advertisement—a reviewable item—meets the standards of the Act, as follows:

- The item must be a reasonable means of achieving one or more of the following objectives:
 - to inform the public of current or proposed government policies, programs, or services;
 - to inform the public of its rights and responsibilities under the law;
 - to encourage or discourage specific social behaviour in the public interest; and/or
 - to promote Ontario, or any part of the province, as a good place to live, work, invest, study, or visit, or to promote any economic activity or sector of Ontario's economy.
- The item must include a statement that it is paid for by the government of Ontario.
- The item must not include the name, voice, or image of a member of the Executive Council (cabinet) or a member of the Legislative Assembly (unless the primary target audience is located outside Ontario, in which case the item is exempt from this requirement).
- The item must not have as a primary objective the fostering of a positive impression of the governing party, or a negative impression of a person or entity critical of the government.
- The item must not be partisan; that is, in the opinion of the Auditor General, it cannot have as a primary objective the promotion of the partisan political interests of the governing party.

OTHER FACTORS

In addition to the specific statutory standards above, the Act allows the Auditor General to consider additional factors to determine whether a primary objective of an item is to promote the partisan political interests of the governing party [subsection 6(4)]. In general, the additional factors that we consider relate to the general impression conveyed by the message and how it is likely to be received or perceived. In determining whether an item may be perceived or received as partisan, consideration is given to whether it includes certain desirable characteristics and avoids certain undesirable ones, as follows:

- Each item should:
 - contain subject matter relevant to government responsibilities (that is, the government should have direct and substantial responsibilities for the specific matters dealt with in the item);
 - present information objectively, in tone and content, with facts expressed clearly and accurately, using unbiased and objective language;
 - emphasize facts and/or explanations, not the political merits of proposals; and
 - enable the audience to distinguish between fact on the one hand and comment, opinion, or analysis on the other.
- Items should not:
 - use colours, logos, and/or slogans commonly associated with any recognized political party in the Legislative Assembly of Ontario;
 - inappropriately personalize (for instance, by attacking opponents or critics);
 - directly or indirectly attack, ridicule, or criticize the views, policies, or actions of those critical of the government;
 - be aimed primarily at rebutting the arguments of others;
 - intentionally promote, or be perceived as promoting, political-party interests (to

this end, consideration is also given to such matters as timing of the message, the audience it is aimed at, and the overall environment in which the message will be communicated);

- deliver self-congratulatory or political-party image-building messages;
- deal with matters such as a policy proposal where no decision has yet been made, unless the item provides a balanced explanation of both the benefits and the disadvantages;
- present pre-existing policies, products, services, or activities as if they were new; or
- use a uniform resource locator (URL) to direct readers, viewers, or listeners to a “first click” web page with content that may not meet the standards required by the Act (see Websites).

OTHER REVIEW PROTOCOLS

Since taking on responsibility for reviewing government advertising, my Office has endeavoured to clarify, in co-operation with government offices, areas where the Act is silent. What follows is a brief discussion of the main areas that have required clarification over the years.

Websites

Although websites are not specifically designated as reviewable under the Act, we believe that a website mentioned in an advertisement should be seen as an extension of the ad. Following discussions about this with the government, we came to an agreement that the first page or “click” of a website accessed by using the URL featured in a reviewable item would be included in our review. We agreed not to consider web pages beyond the first click. However, we review the first-click page for any information or messages that may not meet the standards of the Act. For example, the first-click

web page must not include a minister’s name, voice, or photograph, nor deliver self-congratulatory, party image-building messages, or messages that attack the policies, opinions, or actions of others.

Event/Conference Program Advertisements and Payments in Kind

Government advertisements sometimes appear in programs and other materials distributed at public events such as conferences, trade shows and exhibitions. In considering this type of advertisement, we concluded that it should be subject to the Act because the programs usually follow the same format and serve a similar purpose as magazines and other print media. In other words, advertisements are interspersed with content even though such ad space is at times provided to a government office free of charge. On the issue of payment for the advertisement, government offices often make in-kind or financial contributions to an event, including paid sponsorship. Therefore, we consider the “free” advertisement to have been indirectly paid for.

Our rationale was based on the fact that the free advertisement would typically not have been granted if the government office had not made a financial contribution or sponsored the event. Government officials have agreed with our approach to advertisements in programs distributed at public events. Consequently, items in these programs must be submitted for review.

Third-party Advertising

Government funds provided to third parties are sometimes used for the purpose of advertising. The government and my Office have agreed that, for third-party advertising, the advertising must be submitted for review if it meets all of the three following criteria:

- a government office provides the third party with funds intended to pay part or all of the

cost of publishing, displaying, broadcasting, or distributing the item;

- the government grants the third party permission to use the Ontario logo or another official provincial visual identifier in the item; and
- the government office approves the content of the item.

Government Recruitment Advertisements

As previously noted, the Act specifically excludes job advertisements from review. We have interpreted this exemption to apply to advertising for specific government jobs, but not to broad-ranging generic recruitment campaigns, such as ads for the recruitment of medical professionals in Ontario. The government has agreed with our interpretation. As a result, generic recruitment campaigns must be submitted to my Office for review.

Environmental Assessment Notices

The Act exempts from review any government notices required by law. Nevertheless, the Ministry of Natural Resources used to routinely submit for review and approval advertisements for certain classes of environmental assessment notices for provincial parks and conservation reserves. We discussed this with ministry representatives and came to an agreement that, because of the statutory nature of these advertisements, they do not require clearance through my Office.

Pre-reviews and Consultations

A pre-review is available to government offices wishing to have us examine an early version of an item. This can be a script or storyboard, provided that it reasonably and accurately reflects the item as it is intended to appear when completed. Pre-reviews help limit the investment of time and money spent to develop items containing material that could be deemed objectionable under the Act.

If material submitted for pre-review appears to violate the Act, we provide explanatory comments to the government office. If it appears to meet the standards of the Act, we so advise the government office. However, before the item can be published, displayed, broadcast, printed, or otherwise disseminated, the government office must submit the finished item for review to ensure that it still meets the standards of the Act.

A pre-review is strictly voluntary on our part and is outside the statutory requirements of the Act.

External Advisers

Under the *Auditor General Act*, the Auditor General can appoint an Advertising Commissioner to assist in fulfilling the requirements of the *Government Advertising Act, 2004*. However, instead of appointing an Advertising Commissioner, my Office has engaged external advisers to provide assistance and advice in the ongoing review of items submitted for review. The following advisers have been engaged at various times by my Office during the 2008/09 fiscal year:

- Rafe Engle is a Toronto lawyer who specializes in advertising, marketing, communications, and entertainment law. He is also the outside legal counsel for Advertising Standards Canada. Before studying law, Mr. Engle acquired a comprehensive background in media and communications while working in the advertising industry.
- Jonathan Rose is Associate Professor of Political Studies at Queen's University. He is a leading Canadian academic with interests in political advertising and Canadian politics. Professor Rose has written a book on government advertising in Canada and a number of articles on the way in which political parties and governments use advertising.

- Joel Ruimy is a Toronto communications consultant with many years of experience as a journalist, editor, and producer covering Ontario politics in print and television.

These advisers provided invaluable assistance in our review of government advertising this past fiscal year.

Advertising Review Activity, 2008/09

RESULTS OF OUR REVIEWS

During the 2008/09 fiscal year, we reviewed 889 individual advertising items, with a total value of more than \$52 million. We provided our decision in all cases within the required seven-day period. The length of time required for a review and decision can vary, depending on the complexity of the message and on the other work priorities of our review panel. Nevertheless, our average turnaround time during the past fiscal year was 3.5 business days.

We also received and reviewed 14 pre-review submissions that were at a preliminary stage of development, most often at the script or storyboard level. Because pre-reviews are strictly voluntary on our part and outside the statutory requirements of the Act, they are second in priority to finished items. Nonetheless, we make every effort to complete the pre-reviews within a reasonable length of time. The average turnaround time for pre-review submissions in the 2008/09 fiscal year was about four business days.

Of all the submissions reviewed, we rejected five submissions, comprising 15 advertisements, because they did not meet the Act's standards, some of which fostered a positive impression of the governing party. All but one of these advertisements were subsequently revised, resubmitted, and approved.

Although we did not note any contraventions of the Act—advertisements that ran without having been submitted to us for review—we noted a few instances of third-party advertising that seemed problematic. Such advertisements fell into two main categories: ads issued by a third party that receives funding and/or direction from a government office and that communicated a strong Ontario government brand in that they made prominent use of the Ontario logo or mentioned the support or sponsorship of the Ontario government; and ads issued by a third party receiving taxpayer funds that communicated a congratulatory message to the government.

All advertisements in the first category would have been granted approval had our ad panel reviewed them. However, we were still concerned that ads communicating a strong government of Ontario brand will be mistaken as government of Ontario ads, and there is a risk that a similar type of ad that does not meet the standards could run in the future. Therefore, we have initiated discussions with the government offices involved and hope such ads will in future be submitted for review.

As for the second category, we were concerned about one transit advertisement, given its congratulatory message to the government for a recent infrastructure investment together with the prominent use of the Ontario logo. During our inquiries into this issue, we were told that the third party that initiated the ad provided staff in the Premier's office with advance copies of the ad. Our inquiries also revealed that there was no concern expressed about the congratulatory partisan message being delivered by the third party because the ad was not subject to the Act. Although we agreed that this ad falls outside the scope of the Act, we were still concerned that no attempt was made to discourage the third party from the partisan message in the ad. We recommend that the government consider instituting a prohibition on congratulatory partisan advertising by third parties that receive Ontario government funding directly or indirectly.

We were also concerned that use of the Ontario logo in this ad could leave the impression that the ad was somehow sanctioned or endorsed by the government. We were told that neither the funding ministry nor the agency responsible for the government's visual identity program were aware of the ad in question. When we first brought the ad to their attention, we would have expected the government to have expressed concern to the third party about the use of the Ontario logo, given that government policy requires that the use of the logo be authorized by the government. Since then, the government has indicated that, in future, it will endeavour to more rigorously enforce its policy on the use of the Ontario logo.

EXPENDITURES ON ADVERTISEMENTS AND PRINTED MATTER

The *Auditor General Act* requires that the Auditor General report annually to the Legislative Assembly on expenditures for advertisements, printed matter, and messages that are reviewable under the *Government Advertising Act, 2004*.

Figure 1 contains expenditure details of individual advertising campaigns reported to us by each ministry for media-buy costs; agency creative costs; third-party production, talent, and distribution costs; and other third-party costs, such as translation.

In order to test the completeness and accuracy of the reported advertising expenditures, my Office reviewed randomly selected payments to suppliers of advertising and creative services and their supporting documentation at selected ministries. We also performed certain compliance procedures with respect to the requirements of sections 2, 3, 4, and 8 of the *Government Advertising Act, 2004*, which pertain to submission requirements and prohibition on the use of items pending the Auditor General's review. We found no matters of concern in our review work.

Other Matter

PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE GOVERNMENT ADVERTISING ACT, 2004

On March 26, 2009, the government introduced Bill 162, the Budget Measures Act, 2009, which contained, among other things, proposed amendments to the *Government Advertising Act, 2004* (Act). Some of the proposed amendments would have marginally widened the scope of advertising items covered by the Act to include cinema ads; others, however, would have rewritten section 6 of the Act to eliminate some of the existing standards for government advertising and to revoke the Auditor General's discretionary powers to consider additional factors in determining whether an ad is partisan. The proposed amendments also included a more narrow and limited definition of what could be considered partisan.

I acted immediately to express my Office's concerns about the amendments to the Minister of Finance. The most significant of my concerns was that my Office would no longer be able to exercise discretion or use professional judgment on the issue of partisanship. The government responded quickly, and a number of meetings and discussions were held between my staff and senior government officials. These meetings established that our concerns and the proposed amendments were irreconcilable in the short term. As a result, the government decided to postpone amendments until such time as further consultation and discussion could take place. On May 14, 2009, the government withdrew the proposed amendments during debate of Bill 162 in the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Affairs.

Over the course of the discussions that took place about the amendments, my Office maintained that the Act is effective in its current form and that it contributes to ensuring that taxpayer dollars are

not used to fund partisan government advertising. In fact, my Office has hosted several visiting legislators from Australia who wished to discuss the workings of the Act because there was great interest in their jurisdictions to possibly enact similar legislation. According to our research and conversations with legislators in other jurisdictions, the Act in its current form is regarded as the international gold standard for government-advertising legislation. That said, we would welcome the opportunity to continue discussions on possible future amendments to the Act to make it even more effective and transparent.

Figure 1: Expenditures for Reviewable Advertisements and Printed Matter under the Government Advertising Act, 2004, April 1, 2008–March 31, 2009

Source of data: Ontario government offices

Ministry/Campaign Title	# of Submissions	# of Items	Agency Costs (\$)	Third-party Costs (\$)	
				Production	Talent
Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs					
Event Program Messages	5	6	–	–	–
Foodland Ontario	3	56	–	–	18,342
Foodland Ontario ¹	–	–	–	–	–
Foodland Ontario ²	1	62	–	–	–
Pick Ontario Freshness	5	14	–	–	127,748
Pick Ontario Freshness ²	1	4	–	644,349	178,651
Public Information Sessions	1	1	–	–	–
Children and Youth Services (Women's Issues)					
Ontario Child Benefit	3	14	67,176	173,606	24,810
Ontario Child Benefit ¹	–	–	–	–	–
Roy McMurtry Youth Centre	1	4	1,972	551	–
Citizenship and Immigration					
Amethyst Awards ³	1	1	–	–	–
Global Experience Ontario	1	1	–	–	–
Global Experience Ontario ¹	–	–	–	–	–
Order of Ontario	1	2	750	1,333	–
Remembrance Day	1	2	75	45	–
Community and Social Services (Francophone Affairs)					
Accessibility Standards	1	1	–	5,911	–
Accessibility Standards ¹	–	–	–	–	–
Adoption Disclosure Legislation Change	1	2	151,875	109,116	–
Adoption Disclosure Legislation Change ²	1	2	–	80,768	–
Community Safety and Correctional Services					
Forensic Services and Coroner's Complex	1	2	–	2,370	–
Public Information Sessions	3	6	–	5,258	–
RIDE	1	1	–	–	–
Economic Development					
Economy	1	10	170,659	63,450	13,774
Economy ¹	–	–	–	–	18,598
Economy ³	2	10	–	–	–
Education					
Student Success Program	6	33	279,018	439,400	–
Student Success Program ³	1	1	–	–	–

1. ad submission from 2007/08, with (more) expenditures in 2008/09

2. ad submission from 2008/09, with (more) expenditures to be reported in 2009/10

3. violation—ad was reviewed and did not meet the required standards

Third-party Costs (\$) cont'd		Media Costs (\$)				Ad Value**	Campaign
Bulk Mail	Other	TV	Radio	Print	Out-of-Home*	(\$)	Total (\$)
–	–	–	–	25,485	4,866	–	30,351
–	–	1,720,863	365,701	–	3,483	–	2,108,389
–	–	–	–	–	20,500	–	20,500
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
–	–	2,536,795	692,021	72,999	222,837	–	3,652,400
–	24,000	–	–	–	–	–	847,000
–	–	–	–	–	–	1,350	1,350
–	3,289	51,011	–	–	461,798	–	781,690
–	–	734,279	–	–	–	–	734,279
1,086	324	–	–	1,804	–	–	5,737
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
–	–	–	–	–	–	996	996
–	–	–	–	-5,831	–	–	-5,831
–	–	–	–	97,555	–	–	99,638
–	–	–	–	27,720	–	–	27,840
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	5,911
–	–	–	–	-260	–	–	-260
–	–	–	–	2,182,901	–	–	2,443,892
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	80,768
2,262	–	–	–	1,803	–	–	6,435
2,416	2,400	–	–	2,493	–	–	12,567
–	–	263,012	–	–	–	–	263,012
–	3,064	–	225,241	394,227	–	–	870,415
–	–	1,922,454	–	–	–	–	1,941,052
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
–	–	1,032,658	–	891,465	–	16,100	2,658,641
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–

* Out-of-Home advertising includes, for example, billboards and transit posters.

** Ad Value denotes the value of an ad space provided to government offices at no cost, often where the government has provided funding for a related event/publication.

Ministry/Campaign Title	# of Submissions	# of Items	Agency Costs (\$)	Third-party Costs (\$)	
				Production	Talent
Energy and Infrastructure					
Ontario Home Energy Savings Program	2	2	58,280	15,975	500
Ontario Solar Thermal Heating Incentive ¹	—	—	—	—	—
PowerWISE Phase IV ¹	—	—	—	—	—
Environment					
Additup	4	78	199,195	441,030	35,809
Additup ²	1	2	4,500	13,954	—
Drinking Water Ontario	2	2	—	400	—
Lake Simcoe Protection Plan	2	5	—	4,092	—
Ontario Environment Leaders	1	1	—	—	—
Finance					
Ontario Budget ¹	—	—	45,965	—	—
Ontario Savings Bonds	1	32	275,890	112,768	32,379
PST Exemption	1	21	2,975	20,497	—
Government Services					
Discover the Ontario Public Service	1	1	—	1,485	—
Newborn Registration Service	1	1	—	—	—
ServiceOntario	1	2	—	—	—
ServiceOntario ²	1	1	—	—	—
Health and Long-Term Care					
ColonCancerCheck	5	25	120,800	8,104	—
Flu	4	36	168,174	468,570	135,835
Flu ¹	—	—	—	—	—
Health Care Options	3	10	58,800	624,501	89,662
HealthForce Ontario	3	9	58,990	41,450	—
HealthForce Ontario ¹	—	—	—	—	—
Hepatitis C ¹	—	—	—	—	—
HIV Anonymous Testing Sites ¹	—	—	16,480	5,722	—
HPV	5	12	101,625	22,033	5,956
Mumps	3	7	26,738	10,338	—
Notice to Solicitors	2	2	—	—	—
Nurse Practitioner-led Clinics	2	6	—	975	—
Ontario Citizens' Council	1	1	—	6,209	—
Ontario Health Card	1	4	—	94	—
Organ Donation	2	2	—	8,550	—
Public Notice	1	2	—	975	—
West Nile Virus ¹	—	—	—	—	—
Health Promotion					
Diabetes Prevention	1	1	6,631	—	—
Diabetes Prevention ²	2	21	19,125	—	—

1. ad submission from 2007/08, with (more) expenditures in 2008/09

2. ad submission from 2008/09, with (more) expenditures to be reported in 2009/10

Third-party Costs (\$) cont'd		Media Costs (\$)				Ad Value**	Campaign
Bulk Mail	Other	TV	Radio	Print	Out-of-Home*	(\$)	Total (\$)
–	–	–	–	280,744	–	–	355,499
–	–	–	–	19,874	–	–	19,874
–	–	–	–	-3,611	–	–	-3,611
–	18,475	1,059,007	385,666	173,436	–	–	2,312,618
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	18,454
–	–	–	–	–	–	1,000	1,400
–	–	–	–	77,099	–	–	81,191
–	–	–	–	–	–	500	500
–	5,065	–	–	-1,174	–	–	49,856
19,131	5,940	746,109	84,762	766,011	59,934	–	2,102,924
–	7,235	–	–	328,748	–	–	359,455
–	–	–	–	16,564	–	–	18,049
–	–	–	–	–	–	150	150
–	57	–	–	25,000	–	–	25,057
–	–	–	–	3,448	–	–	3,448
–	2,000	2,185,781	–	17,364	–	–	2,334,049
–	17,957	1,039,839	393,105	–	118,360	–	2,341,840
–	–	–	–	-627	–	–	-627
–	3,204	1,383,867	–	–	–	–	2,160,034
–	786	71,476	–	325,002	751,156	2,050	1,250,910
–	–	–	587	-1,304	–	2,050	1,333
–	–	–	–	-400	–	–	-400
–	–	–	–	57,598	322,189	–	401,989
–	3,433	–	642,095	102,493	124,555	–	1,002,190
–	–	–	39,859	24,253	54,585	–	155,773
–	–	–	–	4,631	–	–	4,631
–	334	–	–	8,389	–	–	9,698
–	25	–	–	264,601	–	–	270,835
–	–	–	–	1,399	–	–	1,493
–	–	–	–	345,283	–	–	353,833
–	334	–	–	16,598	–	–	17,907
–	–	–	4,750	–	–	–	4,750
–	–	–	–	448,205	–	–	454,836
–	15,120	–	–	–	–	–	34,245

* Out-of-Home advertising includes, for example, billboards and transit posters.

** Ad Value denotes the value of an ad space provided to government offices at no cost, often where the government has provided funding for a related event/publication.

Ministry/Campaign Title	# of Submissions	# of Items	Agency Costs (\$)	Third-party Costs (\$)	
				Production	Talent
Health Promotion (continued)					
EatRight Ontario	3	47	2,711	6,287	–
EatRight Ontario ¹	–	–	–	–	–
EatRight Ontario ²	2	4	2,975	–	–
Event Program Messages	2	6	–	–	–
Event Program Messages ³	1	3	–	–	–
Smoke-free Ontario	7	55	380,653	315,406	–
Smoke-free Ontario ¹	–	–	–	–	29,519
International Trade and Investment					
Business Immigration	11	110	835,434	75,469	–
Next Generation of Jobs Fund	3	5	17,255	6,946	–
Next Generation of Jobs Fund ¹	–	–	–	–	–
Trade (Domestic)	1	1	–	616	–
Labour					
Minimum Wage Increase	1	12	2,951	–	–
Safe at Work Ontario	1	1	1,728	–	–
Municipal Affairs and Housing					
Greenbelt Expansion Criteria Consultations ¹	–	–	–	350	–
Homeownership Program	1	2	–	–	–
Ontario West Municipal Conference	1	1	–	–	–
Natural Resources					
50 Million Trees	5	6	–	1,088	–
Bear Wise	1	8	–	10,866	–
Family Fishing Weekend ¹	–	–	–	162	–
FireSmart Wildfire Prevention	1	12	–	540	–
Fisheries Management Plan	2	2	–	–	–
Fishing Regulation Changes	2	2	–	–	–
Kirkland Lake Management Strategy	1	1	–	–	–
Land Information Ontario	1	1	–	–	–
Land Information Ontario ¹	–	–	–	–	–
Land Management Plan	1	1	–	–	–
Local Citizens Committee	2	3	–	–	–
Local Citizens Committee ²	1	1	–	–	–
Management Advisory Committee	1	1	–	–	–
Ontario Parks	14	17	–	1,353	–
Ontario Parks ¹	–	–	–	167	–
Ontario Parks ²	1	1	–	–	–
Outdoors Card Renewal	1	1	–	138	–
Saugeen Shores Visitor Guide	1	1	–	–	–
Seasonal Leasing of Campsites	4	6	–	–	–

1. ad submission from 2007/08, with (more) expenditures in 2008/09

2. ad submission from 2008/09, with (more) expenditures to be reported in 2009/10

3. violation—ad was reviewed and did not meet the required standards

Third-party Costs (\$) cont'd		Media Costs (\$)				Ad Value**	Campaign
Bulk Mail	Other	TV	Radio	Print	Out-of-Home*	(\$)	Total (\$)
–	5,907	–	–	353,700	–	275	368,880
–	–	211,071	–	211,387	10,012	–	432,470
–	4,200	–	–	–	–	–	7,175
–	–	–	–	–	–	665,000	665,000
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
15,000	6,400	–	–	1,356,139	119,187	–	2,192,785
–	–	163,512	2,371	6,644	-746	–	201,300
–	6,238	–	–	6,691,124	–	10,950	7,619,215
–	1,615	–	–	259,305	–	3,750	288,871
–	–	–	–	159,860	–	–	159,860
–	–	–	–	–	–	5,500	6,116
–	6,000	–	–	138,052	–	–	147,003
–	–	–	–	–	–	5,160	6,888
–	–	–	–	3,727	–	–	4,077
–	–	–	–	–	–	12,377	12,377
–	–	–	–	–	–	1,195	1,195
–	–	–	5,979	6,015	–	30,376	43,458
–	182	–	–	199,675	–	–	210,723
–	–	–	–	–	–	10,400	10,562
–	–	–	–	6,247	–	–	6,787
–	–	–	–	3,999	–	–	3,999
–	–	–	–	1,691	–	–	1,691
–	–	–	–	250	–	–	250
–	–	–	–	–	–	1,590	1,590
–	–	–	–	1,890	–	–	1,890
–	–	–	–	326	–	–	326
–	56	–	–	1,061	–	–	1,117
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
–	–	–	–	894	–	–	894
–	90	–	–	39,185	–	18,989	59,617
–	–	–	–	–	–	16,305	16,472
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
–	–	–	–	–	–	7,300	7,438
–	–	–	–	855	–	–	855
–	103	–	–	2,691	–	–	2,794

* Out-of-Home advertising includes, for example, billboards and transit posters.

** Ad Value denotes the value of an ad space provided to government offices at no cost, often where the government has provided funding for a related event/publication.

Ministry/Campaign Title	# of Submissions	# of Items	Agency Costs (\$)	Third-party Costs (\$)	
				Production	Talent
Natural Resources (continued)					
Seasonal Leasing of Campsites ¹	–	–	–	–	–
Tag Draw Application Deadline Change	1	1	–	229	–
Water Management Plan	4	4	–	–	–
Water Management Plan ⁴	–	1	–	–	–
Youth Programs	1	1	–	–	–
Northern Development and Mines					
Mining Act Consultations	1	2	4,271	–	–
Northern Ontario Heritage Fund	1	2	–	–	–
Northern Ontario Heritage Fund ²	1	1	–	–	–
Research and Innovation					
Economy ⁵	–	–	–	–	–
Invest Ontario	1	1	–	–	–
Invest Ontario ²	1	1	–	–	–
Next Generation of Jobs Fund ¹	–	–	–	–	–
Revenue					
If You Sell Tobacco	1	1	–	1,385	–
Small Business and Consumer Service					
Summer Company	1	1	14,355	18,540	4,100
Summer Company ¹	–	–	–	–	–
Training, Colleges and Universities					
Employment Ontario	4	13	291,640	911,621	51,876
Skills to Jobs	5	23	319,087	570,201	78,648
Study in Ontario	1	3	6,000	4,335	–
Transportation					
Veterans Licence Plates	2	2	–	21,952	3,903
Veterans Licence Plates ¹	–	–	9,000	10,707	3,578
Total	193	889	3,723,753	5,292,237	853,688

1. ad submission from 2007/08, with (more) expenditures in 2008/09

2. ad submission from 2008/09, with (more) expenditures to be reported in 2009/10

4. ad cancelled or did not run

5. ad developed by another ministry, but used here

Third-party Costs (\$) cont'd		Media Costs (\$)				Ad Value**	Campaign
Bulk Mail	Other	TV	Radio	Print	Out-of-Home*	(\$)	Total (\$)
–	–	–	–	536	–	–	536
–	–	–	–	12,300	–	–	12,529
–	–	–	–	3,370	–	–	3,370
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
–	–	–	–	–	–	7,295	7,295
–	–	–	–	1,467	–	–	5,738
–	–	–	–	25,463	–	–	25,463
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
–	–	–	–	–	–	1,195	1,195
–	–	–	–	–	–	1,500	1,500
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
–	–	–	–	–	–	1,500	1,500
3,800	–	–	–	–	–	–	5,185
–	–	–	–	70,150	–	–	107,145
–	–	–	28,142	–	–	–	28,142
–	201,424	1,292,568	–	–	–	29,250	2,778,379
–	121,452	2,079,186	238,319	554,157	–	–	3,961,050
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	10,335
–	–	–	–	290,111	–	–	315,966
–	–	–	–	561	–	–	23,846
43,695	466,709	18,493,488	3,108,598	17,394,817	2,272,716	854,103	52,503,801

* Out-of-Home advertising includes, for example, billboards and transit posters.

** Ad Value denotes the value of an ad space provided to government offices at no cost, often where the government has provided funding for a related event/publication.