

## Chapter 4

### Section 4.09

Ministry of Community Safety and Correctional Services

# Ontario Provincial Police

Follow-up to VFM Section 3.10, 2012 Annual Report

RECOMMENDATION STATUS OVERVIEW					
	# of Actions Recommended	Status of Actions Recommended			
		Fully Implemented	In Process of Being Implemented	Little or No Progress	Will Not Be Implemented
Recommendation 1	1		1		
Recommendation 2	2		1	1	
Recommendation 3	4	1	3		
Recommendation 4	3			2	1
Recommendation 5	2	2			
Recommendation 6	2		1	1	
Recommendation 7	3		3		
Recommendation 8	2	2			
Recommendation 9	2	2			
Recommendation 10	2		1		1
Recommendation 11	3		1		2
Recommendation 12	2	1		1	
<b>Total</b>	<b>28</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>%</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>28.5</b>	<b>39</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>14.5</b>

## Background

The Ontario Provincial Police (OPP) provides front-line police services in areas that do not have their own police forces, patrols provincial highways, and conducts investigations into complex criminal cases and organized crime. It also offers policing services

on a contractual, cost-recovery basis to municipalities that request them and provides emergency and other support services to all communities in the province.

The OPP employs about 6,200 police officers and 2,400 civilian employees (6,270 officers and 2,300 civilian employees in 2011/12). It operates 77 detachments, which have 88 satellite police

stations reporting to them (78 detachments and 87 stations in 2011/12).

OPP operating expenditures totalled \$1.005 billion in the 2013/14 fiscal year (\$979 million in 2011/12), with staffing costs making up 86% of that amount (87% in 2011/12). The OPP provides municipal policing services to 324 municipalities (322 in 2011/12) on a cost-recovery basis, as well as to 20 First Nations communities (19 in 2011/12), and was reimbursed \$379 million in 2013/14 (\$362 million in 2011/12) from municipalities.

In our *2012 Annual Report*, we noted that over the previous two decades, crime rates across Canada had declined by more than 40%, and Ontario had been part of this trend. Since our previous audit of the OPP in 2005, crime rates reported by the OPP had decreased 10%, and serious motor vehicle accidents had also been trending down, with both fatalities and injuries decreasing. Over the previous five years, the number of calls for service the OPP had responded to or initiated had remained relatively stable.

However, OPP expenditures net of recoveries from municipalities had increased by 27% over the previous five years. Most of the increase had occurred because more officers had been hired and staff had received higher compensation. We found that many other large police forces in Canada had similar expenditure increases, notwithstanding the declining rates of crime and serious motor vehicle accidents.

We found in our 2012 audit that many of the issues we reported on in 2005 continued to exist. Our major observations included the following:

- We found that officers faced significantly different workloads depending on where they were assigned, with some officers handling 54% to 137% more calls than officers in other detachments. The reason for this may have been a staffing model that was almost 30 years old and that was used to deploy only about 45% of the 2,800 front-line officers.
- In 2005, the OPP told us it was working with the RCMP on a new officer-deployment

computer model. The OPP had since claimed it was using this new model, but it was not. In March 2012, the OPP's existing model calculated that the force needed 500 more front-line officers, whereas the new model calculated it needed 50 fewer officers.

- OPP management had little control over shift scheduling at detachments, and almost all officers chose to work 12-hour shifts. This resulted in overstaffing during slow early-morning hours; addressing this could have resulted in savings in the range of \$5 million to \$10 million per year.
- OPP officers were among the highest compensated officers in Canada. Officers and civilians received certain benefits to which other members of the Ontario public service were not entitled, including significantly better pension benefits and other allowances.
- Although the OPP had lowered its overtime costs for the fiscal year ended March 31, 2005, by 10% to \$33 million, overtime costs had increased by 60% to \$53 million for the fiscal year ended March 31, 2012.
- The overall cost of OPP services for municipalities from 2007 to 2011 increased an average of 29% for those with contracts and 19% for those without—up to three times the annual inflation rate. While municipal officials told us that they were very satisfied with the OPP services they received, they expressed concern about these cost increases.

We made a number of recommendations for improvements and received commitments from the Ministry of Community Safety and Correctional Services that it would take action to address them.

## Status of Actions Taken on Recommendations

Overall, the OPP has either fully implemented or made some progress in addressing 67.5% of our

recommendations. However, it has made little or no progress on 18% of our recommendations and has said it will not be implementing another 14.5% of our recommendations.

The OPP has made some progress in improving its process for managing staffing resources. In our 2012 audit, we recommended that the OPP reassess the two computer-based models it was using to determine how many front-line officers it needed at detachments, and use only the one that provides the best estimate of officers needed. Since then, the OPP has tested and compared the two models—the older Deployment Model and the newer Policing Resource Model—and determined that the Deployment Model was the most suitable because it is designed to reflect the integrated municipal and provincial service delivery model used by the OPP in most detachments. Use of the Policing Resource Model has since been discontinued. However, the Deployment Model covers neither 55% of the officers nor any of the over 600 civilians at detachments, and no other process has been developed for rationalizing their numbers.

Our 2012 audit concluded that changing officers' shift schedules could either result in savings of \$5 million to \$10 million per year, or lead to improved service by better allocating staff to match the demand for service. The OPP has made some progress in changing shift schedules; however, it advised us that issues such as collective bargaining, the vast geography of the OPP detachments, training, court appearances, and supervisory and vehicle requirements continue to be barriers to altering shift schedules to save money. The OPP has lowered overtime expenditures by 27% (\$14.1 million), from \$52.8 million for the year ended March 31, 2012, to \$38.7 million for the year ended March 31, 2014. To achieve these savings, the OPP imposed overtime constraints on all regions and bureaus, and changed shift schedules for some detachments to reduce overtime.

The OPP has not acted on our recommendation to address inaccuracies and inconsistencies between

the two systems it uses for recording and reporting critical data such as police calls for service.

The current status of action taken on each of our recommendations is as follows.

## Funding Levels for Policing

### Recommendation 1

*To support future decisions on funding for the Ontario Provincial Police, given the long-term trend of decreasing crime rates and fewer serious motor-vehicle accidents in Ontario and across Canada, the OPP, in conjunction with the Ministry of Community Safety and Correctional Services, should formally assess the correlation of its funding and staffing levels with the actual demand for policing services, based on such factors as calls for service, motor vehicle fatalities and injuries, number of reported offences, clearance rates for crimes and crime severity levels.*

**Status: In the process of being implemented.**

### Details

The OPP informed us that it has not formally assessed the long-term trend of its funding and staff resources in relation to the actual demand for policing services. However, the OPP's efforts have been focused on improving its deployment model, identifying best practices for more cost-effective policing, and improving its capacity to plan staff resources to match actual demand for services.

The OPP's annual budgets continue to be reviewed and approved by the Ministry, as part of the Ministry of Finance's annual budget approval process. Since our 2012 audit, the number of officers is down by 67 and civilian staff is up 98, and total operating expenditures have increased by 2.6% over the two years. Crime rates and severity of crimes have continued to modestly decline, although the OPP reports that the number of calls for service rose 1.7% from 2011 to 2013. We were advised that the OPP has been asked to reduce its expenditures for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2015, by \$19 million to help address the province's annual budget deficit.

The OPP noted that crime rates are not always an accurate barometer of the need for police resources, given that proactive work and preventive programs often help reduce crime. As well, calls for service do not include proactive and preventive work such as crime abatement, street checks, RIDE checks and community mobilization initiatives. While crime rates are down, the OPP advised us that the complexity and demands of the criminal justice system have increased significantly, including investigations that are more complex and time-consuming, longer trials and complex legal issues and the need for increased training such as mandatory annual certification of firearms, use-of-force training and driver training.

The OPP's Deployment Model has been updated to reflect the current operational and workload standards and staffing requirements for front-line services at detachments, and the OPP advised us that preliminary results indicated that more officers were needed to meet its policing requirements in detachments. The model includes a number of core parameters used to determine front-line policing, including calls for service and all motor-vehicle collisions. A project team reviewed the values assigned to the core parameters and updated them where needed. Although the Deployment Model study supports the fact that crime rates are decreasing, the OPP further advised us that factors such as more mental-health calls have increased the average time per call. The OPP said it planned to continue to assess the correlation between prevention activities, crime rates and calls for services, and link these in any future modelling.

The OPP is planning to hold a symposium in late 2014 or early 2015 with other major Canadian police services to share ideas and approaches regarding best practices for delivery of policing and staffing models.

In a reorganization in October 2013, the OPP's program and financial analysts, business planners, researchers and statisticians were brought together into one department within the newly reconfigured Business Management Bureau to improve the

OPP's capacity to perform statistical analysis and share information.

The Ministry of Community Safety and Correctional Services (Ministry) created the Future of Policing Advisory Committee (Committee) in 2012 to solicit strategic advice from community groups, other police services, civilian governing authorities, police associations and other government departments and agencies as part of a review of core police services under Ontario's *Police Services Act*. The goal of the Committee is to determine core and non-core police services to provide for effective, efficient and sustainable police service delivery and costs in Ontario. The Committee oversees a number of working groups, including those looking at crime prevention, law enforcement and victims' assistance, public order maintenance and emergency response, and administration and infrastructure. Recommendations for changes to legislation and regulations and/or policy matters are anticipated by fall 2014.

## Managing Costs

### Recommendation 2

*To help ensure that the number of front-line officers at each detachment is based primarily on need and that officers are cost-effectively deployed, the Ontario Provincial Police should reassess its two computer-based models to determine which one provides the best estimate of requirements based on up-to-date and accurate operational and workload standards, and, once validated, use its staffing models to deploy and reassign officers.*

**Status: In the process of being implemented.**

*The OPP should also establish formal staffing methodologies for the other 44% of detachment staff not covered by its deployment model.*

**Status: Little or no progress.**

### Details

The OPP has approximately 4,400 of its 6,200 officers and 640 of its 2,400 civilian staff working in

77 detachments. Of the 4,400 officers working at detachments, about 2,850 officers are assigned to front-line general law enforcement. In order to deploy front-line officers cost-effectively and based on need, the OPP tested and compared its two computer-based models—the older Deployment Model and the newer Policing Resource Model. The OPP determined that the Deployment Model was still the most suitable because it is designed to reflect the integrated municipal and provincial service delivery model used by the OPP in most detachments. Use of the Policing Resource Model, which was originally developed by the RCMP with assistance from the OPP, has since been discontinued.

In our 2012 audit report, we found that of the then 2,800 officers assigned to front-line duties in detachments, the Deployment Model was used to calculate how to deploy only about 1,250, or 45%, of these officers, and only to those detachments that provide policing services under contract to municipalities. The model was not used to assess the deployment of some 1,550, or 55%, of other officers to detachments that provide other front-line policing services, such as patrolling provincial highways, or to municipalities that use the OPP to provide basic police service without contracts. The OPP advised us that staffing in detachments has not changed significantly since 2012 and remains primarily based on historical numbers; there has been no province-wide rationalization of the numbers. We were informed that there is no immediate plan to use the Deployment Model to assign all front-line officers, to both contract and non-contract municipalities.

The OPP has updated the Deployment Model's parameters, which are used to determine specific kinds of policing demands in detachments. An internal project team reviewed the validity of the values assigned to six core parameters, including detachment-area characteristics, number and type of citizen-generated calls for service, percentage of time an officer is available to respond to a call for service, patrol standards, total hours that officers are available for front-line policing and minimum staffing levels for officer safety. These

parameters were updated as needed. Statisticians within the OPP's Business Management Bureau were in the process of reviewing the Deployment Model results and its potential impacts. Once this review was completed, the OPP was to compare actual staffing levels at detachments with staffing levels recommended by the model to determine whether the front-line staffing complement at each detachment was appropriate or needed adjusting. We were told that because detachments and local needs were diverse, OPP officials would have to analyze operations to determine actual staffing needs. Final approval of the Deployment Model update and assessment of the staffing requirements at detachments was scheduled to be completed by December 2014.

The OPP has made little progress in developing a formal staffing template for the other 44% of staff who work in detachments but are not covered by the Deployment Model. This includes 1,550 officers who do not perform front-line duties and 640 civilian staff. During our 2012 audit we were told that these people were deployed at detachments based on historical levels, and that, at the time, the OPP was engaged in a project to develop templates for detachment staffing and to identify inconsistencies and inequities in current detachment staffing levels. However, the project has since been put on hold until the updates to the Deployment Model are implemented. The OPP advised us it is planning to conduct further research with other police agencies on staffing models through a symposium to be held in late 2014 or early 2015.

As a result, the OPP is still not able to justify its detachment staffing levels, nor has it addressed the significant workload imbalances we noted in 2012.

## Officer Shift Scheduling

### Recommendation 3

*In order to reduce operating costs and/or make the best use of available officers' time to more effectively respond to calls for service, the Ontario Provincial Police should:*

- *implement measures to give management greater control over officers' shift scheduling and vacation entitlements to better co-ordinate staffing with hourly, daily and monthly demand for police services;*

**Status: In the process of being implemented.**

- *provide detachment management with regular information that compares workload with staffing levels during all times of the year;*

**Status: Fully implemented.**

- *reassess its current practice of having almost all detachments operate on a 24-hour basis to identify the savings potential of reducing operating hours at some detachments; and*

**Status: In the process of being implemented.**

- *monitor adherence to the existing policy requirement that staff scheduling practices at detachments be formally reviewed annually to assess their efficiency and cost effectiveness.*

**Status: In the process of being implemented.**

### Details

In our 2012 audit report we concluded that changing shift schedules could either result in savings of \$5 million to \$10 million per year, or lead to improved service by better allocating staff to demand for service. The OPP agreed that some savings or efficiencies would occur through shift scheduling changes. However, due to various barriers such as collective bargaining, the vast geography of the OPP detachments, training, court appearances and supervisory and vehicle requirements, the OPP advised us that shift changes cannot be made in every detachment, and this significantly limits the potential for savings.

Detachment commanders continue to have limited control over officers' shift scheduling at detachments, and the process for changing shift schedules is lengthy and onerous. Officers generally must agree to proposed changes, and often the officers' union, the Ontario Provincial Police Association (OPPA), is involved. Changes can include shorter or

longer shifts, as well as staggered shifts, where officers start at various times during the day to allow for more resources at peak times. OPP officials advised us that they were unsuccessful in including shift scheduling in the spring 2013 collective agreement negotiations and would continue to press for this when the current agreement expires December 31, 2014.

To provide detachments with information that compares workload and staffing levels throughout the year, a new Time Information Management Report (TIMR) was implemented in the summer of 2013. TIMR provides information monthly that allows for comparing demand for police services with staffing levels, overtime and absences. TIMR uses information from the OPP's Daily Activity Reporting (DAR) system, including sick leave, paid duty, overtime and calls for service, and provides an analysis as to how a detachment deploys its resources. For example, it compares peak periods of calls for service with what percentage of resources are deployed. TIMR displays this data on a graph by hour and date so management can see what resources are employed when calls for service are high compared to when they are low. This provides detachment commanders information to propose staggering shifts to meet workload demands and save overtime costs. Regions have reported that TIMRs help with completing shift scheduling reviews. Detachment and regional office staff have been trained in the use of TIMR tools.

In our 2012 audit report we noted that the OPP operated 77 of its 78 detachments on a 24-hour basis in 2011. We recommended that the OPP reassess this practice to identify potential savings by reducing operating hours at some detachments. The OPP has reassessed certain locations, and two additional locations are no longer operating on a 24-hour basis. This is a result of a decrease in the number of OPP officers due to the end of funding from the five-year federal Police Officers Recruitment Fund.

In our 2012 audit report we noted that the required annual shift scheduling reviews were not being conducted and that a committee that

was established to review shift scheduling annually had not yet met. The OPP advised us that the shift scheduling review process was initiated province-wide in December 2013. All detachments were required to complete reviews, and regional headquarters then submitted review summaries to General Headquarters. The shift scheduling committee, which consists of representatives from OPP senior management and the officers' union, was to complete a provincial summary by fall 2014. This will provide a summary of detachment shift scheduling practices so detachments can compare their operational practices. OPP officials advised us that once the provincial report was done, they would assess whether changes in detachment shift schedules would result in cost savings or improvements to service delivery. The results so far indicate that most detachments are using or are planning to use some degree of staggered shift scheduling to better utilize resources and reduce overtime costs.

## Use of Civilians

### Recommendation 4

*To help ensure that non-policing duties and responsibilities are handled as cost-effectively as possible, the Ontario Provincial Police should:*

- *conduct a review of all staffing positions and responsibilities at its detachments and its regional headquarters and General Headquarters to determine where opportunities exist to fill positions currently held by officers with civilians at a lower cost;*

**Status: Little or no progress.**

- *establish cost-saving targets and timelines for designating positions to either civilians or officers, depending on the duties of the position; and*

**Status: Little or no progress.**

- *reassign officers who are currently in civilian positions back to front-line policing where possible.*

**Status: Will not be implemented.**

**(We continue to believe this is an important and valid recommendation.)**

### Details

The OPP has not conducted a full review of all staffing positions and responsibilities at its detachments, regional headquarters and General Headquarters to determine where opportunities exist to fill positions currently held by officers with civilians at a lower cost. In addition, no new human resources policy had been established to require that civilians be considered to replace police officers where opportunities exist. Notwithstanding, the OPP advised us that it was planning to formally review and rationalize positions when they become vacant to determine whether the position should be filled by an officer or a civilian, or whether the position should be classified as a hybrid position for which both officers and civilians could apply. In this way, the review and implementation would occur simultaneously. The OPP is required to provide formal disclosure to the OPPA when changes are proposed to any position within the organization. During that notice period the OPPA has the right to contest the change to a civilian designation, and extensive discussion is required. The OPP noted that some positions are used to place officers who are being accommodated for pregnancy, injury, illness or any other cause that renders them unable to go out to calls. This would reduce the number of civilian positions available and the potential salary savings opportunities.

In our *2012 Annual Report*, we noted that a cost savings of \$5.4 million could result if civilian employees took over more court and community services duties. At the time of our follow-up, the OPP had not opened any of these positions to civilian employees. The OPP told us that it has no ability operationally or within the confines of the collective agreement to have civilians fill specific positions held by officers quickly. As well, the OPP has determined that there are operational benefits to keeping these as positions for officers. The OPP is expecting more than 600 officers to retire between now and 2016. Review and rationalization will occur for each vacant position.

The OPP informed us it had established internally a target of saving \$300,000 for converting

officer to civilian positions over the past 24 months. As a result, 22 officer positions were replaced with civilians for an annual cost savings of \$318,000. Examples of positions converted include communications trainer, operational analyst, tactical analyst, contract policing analyst and Crime Stoppers co-ordinator. The OPP had no further cost-saving targets and timelines for designating positions to either civilians or officers. In our 2012 audit report, we referred to a cost-management study where the OPP identified positions in Corporate Services now filled by officers that could just as well be filled by civilians. The study stated that the OPP could save \$760,000 by shifting some positions held by officers to civilians. Of the 22 positions converted to civilian, only three related to Corporate Services for an annual savings of about \$72,000.

The Ontario Internal Audit Division completed a review of the OPP's Aviation Services, which operates its aircraft, in May 2013 and reported that having civilians, rather than officers, in pilots' positions would result in cost savings. Recently, OPPA was informed that future vacancies in Aviation Services would be advertised allowing either civilians or officers to apply.

In regards to our recommendation of reassigning officers who are currently in civilian positions back to front-line policing duties where possible, the OPP advised us that these positions were not reviewed and will not be until the positions become vacant. In some cases these positions are held by accommodated officers who might never return to front-line duties. Accommodated members must get medical clearance before returning to front-line duties.

## Differential Response Unit

### Recommendation 5

*To help achieve the significant cost and operational benefits of implementing a Differential Response Unit (DRU) program to free up front-line officers' time for more serious matters, the Ontario Provincial Police should:*

- *establish a strategic plan for fully implementing its DRU program throughout the province, with targets for measurable savings and benefits, and associated timelines; and*  
**Status: Fully implemented.**
- *given the lack of widespread success in implementing the DRU program over the last decade, consider centralizing the program to improve service levels, enhance consistency and help realize economies of scale and cost savings.*  
**Status: Fully implemented.**

### Details

In August 2012, the OPP completed a review of the Differential Response Unit (DRU) program. The Commissioner's Committee in February 2013 supported an option in the report to phase out the current DRU program and to transition to a new Frontline Support Unit (FSU) model. A project plan was completed in May 2014 identifying staffing requirements, workflow analysis, management oversight, program efficiencies and provincial training. Standard operating procedures and policies, and program performance measures were developed, and initial training was provided. The FSU was launched on July 7, 2014.

While the program is similar to the DRU, the FSU is structured so unit members report operationally to General Headquarters and administratively to their respective detachments. A program manager and provincial support sergeant provide central oversight from General Headquarters. The OPP told us the FSU means resources will be available everywhere in the province for traditional DRU calls. The FSU will also involve a larger number of accommodated officers who are unable to either temporarily or permanently work on front-line policing duties.

Also in July 2014, as part of FSU, the OPP introduced a new Citizen Self-Reporting system on its website, allowing citizens to file police reports online for selected crimes, including lost, damaged or stolen property under \$5,000. An officer



assigned to FSU does the initial investigation of these, leaving regular front-line officers free to respond to higher-priority calls. The program is intended to offer an efficient way to reduce the number of calls an officer need attend, as well as reduce the volume of calls received through the provincial communications centres.

## Officer Compensation

### Recommendation 6

*To help inform future decisions on compensation levels for officers and as part of the preparation for future collective bargaining negotiations, the Ontario Provincial Police (OPP) should analyze the working conditions and compensation levels of its officers in comparison to other major police forces across Canada and in relation to current Ontario government compensation policies.*

**Status: Little or no progress.**

*The OPP should also increase its oversight of overtime expenditures as well as identify and address the underlying reasons for the significant increase in overtime costs in recent years.*

**Status: In the process of being implemented.**

### Details

The Ministry of Government Services negotiates salary rates with the Ontario Provincial Police Association, and the OPP provides analysis of compensation levels and working conditions to the Ministry of Community Safety and Correctional Services and to the Ministry of Government Services to identify opportunities to make policing services more cost effective. The current collective agreement expires December 31, 2014. OPP officers and civilians received no pay increases for 2012 and 2013, and for 2014 received an 8.55% increase in accordance with the collective agreement. The OPP indicated that while it supports the collective bargaining process, decisions on officers' compensation rates and benefits are decided by the ministries involved.

Since our 2012 audit report, there have been no changes to the collective agreement covering salaries and benefits of officers and civilians, or to those of senior management not covered by this agreement. The OPP has also not compared the salary and benefits provided to its officers and civilian workers to that of other Ontario government workers.

In addition, the OPP continues to rely on two types of quarterly surveys conducted by the RCMP of police officers' compensation across Canada. One survey looks at the hourly total compensation, which includes salaries, pensions and benefits, of the nine largest police services in Canada. The other survey looks at only the salaries of first-class constables for 85 police services across Canada that have 50 or more officers. As of March 31, 2014, the OPP ranked third among Canadian police forces at \$72.17 in total compensation per hour. Only the Toronto Police Service (\$75.08/hour) and the Vancouver Police Department (\$72.74/hour) were higher. The OPP and Toronto Police Service rank fourth in annual salaries of first-class constables at \$90,621.

On November 1, 2013, the OPP submitted a letter to the Ontario Association of Police Services Boards (OAPSB) and the Provincial Bargaining Work Group to support exploring co-ordinated bargaining for Ontario's police services, as proposed by the OAPSB and the ministries. Co-ordinated bargaining of upcoming collective agreements for separate police forces would be more efficient and would prevent police associations from benchmarking higher wage settlements of other police forces for use in future negotiations.

The OPP has lowered overtime expenditures by 27% (\$14.1 million), from \$52.8 million for the year ended March 31, 2012, to \$38.7 million for the year ended March 31, 2014. To achieve these savings, the OPP imposed overtime constraints on all regions and bureaus. As previously mentioned, it also provided detachments with a new Time Information Management Report to help schedule officers and reduce overtime.

## Municipal Policing

### Recommendation 7

*To promote better relations with, and consistent services to, municipalities, and fairer and more transparent billing processes, the Ontario Provincial Police, in conjunction with the Ministry of Community Safety and Correctional Services, the Ministry of Finance and municipalities, should:*

- *seek ways to simplify, and make more transparent, its cost-recovery methods and consider whether various grants and credits should be amalgamated into one all-encompassing costing formula;*

**Status: In the process of being implemented.**

- *address the issues in its costing and billing methods that result in municipalities paying different rates and consider phasing in cost increases over time rather than when contracts are renewed; and*

**Status: In the process of being implemented.**

- *consider establishing a policy that would require identifying all costs for providing services to support municipal police forces as well as the proportion to be recovered.*

**Status: In the process of being implemented.**

### Details

To improve communication and accountability regarding the OPP's costing policies and processes, the Ministry of Community Safety and Correctional Services (Ministry) in August 2012 collaborated with the Association of Municipalities of Ontario, municipal representatives, the Ontario Association of Police Services Boards, and the OPP on a document called "Understanding OPP Municipal Policing Costs." The document provides municipalities with an explanation of the OPP's cost-recovery model, the tools the OPP uses to calculate policing charges to municipalities and what contributes to policing costs within their communities. The document has been updated twice on the OPP's website to reflect the most current cost-recovery formula used by the OPP.

The OPP has discussed with the Ministry whether various grants and credits for municipal policing services could be amalgamated into one all-encompassing formula, and several challenges have been identified. As of September 9, 2014, it had been decided that one grant—the Court Security and Prisoner Transportation Grant for OPP-policed municipalities—will be incorporated into the new OPP billing model beginning in 2016. The OPP told us it would continue to work with the Ministry to align other grants and credits with the new billing model.

All components within the municipal cost-recovery formula are now reviewed on an annual basis by the OPP's Business Management Bureau and the Municipal Policing Bureau to reflect the most updated formula. At the time of our follow-up, there were only seven municipalities remaining with contracts that did not permit the OPP to bill them under the most updated formula (compared to 36 in 2012). On December 12, 2013, the Ministry sent notice to municipalities with OPP policing contracts extending beyond January 1, 2015, that their current contract would be terminated on December 31, 2014, in accordance with the agreement that provided for early termination. As of January 1, 2015, all remaining contract and non-contract municipalities will have transitioned to a new billing model.

The Ministry and the OPP have been engaged in developing a new OPP Municipal Billing Model. On September 18, 2013, Treasury Board/Management Board of Cabinet (TB/MBC) approved that the Ministry work with the Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing (MMAH) to engage municipalities and stakeholders on the implementation of a new billing model for recovering the cost of OPP municipal police services, effective January 1, 2015. Since 2013, the OPP and the Ministry have engaged in consultations with municipalities and police services boards, as well as their associations, in the development of a new billing model.

On August 13, 2014, TB/MBC approved implementation of a new billing model. The model

incorporates a 60% base cost and 40% variable costs, plus municipal-specific costs for overtime, accommodation and court security, to arrive at the total OPP municipal policing costs allocated to each municipality. The base cost includes the cost for officer availability to respond to calls for service, crime prevention, patrols, RIDE, traffic-safety initiatives, and infrastructure, and will be allocated to each municipality based on the number of households and business properties. The variable cost will be based on the cost of the OPP responding to calls for service within the municipality, and each municipality will receive a breakdown of their calls for service, allowing them to see what they are paying for. In addition, municipalities can request policing contract enhancements on a cost-recovery basis. The new model is intended to be revenue neutral for the province and the overall amounts collected from municipalities will increase over time as the OPP's costs increase. Any changes to the amounts that each municipality is charged resulting from the use of the new model will be phased in over five years, commencing with the 2015 contracts. In late September 2014, the OPP sent billing statements to all municipalities informing them of their new policing costs for 2015.

In our 2012 audit report we noted that the OPP is sometimes called on to assist municipal police forces, but it has never charged municipalities for these services. The OPP informed us that in recent years, a number of municipal police forces have been relying on the OPP on an as-needed basis for certain services, such as providing canine units. On May 14, 2013, as part of the 2013/14 Ministry's Results-based Planning, the TB/MBC approved the Ministry's request to explore options for an initiative to partially recover OPP support costs from municipalities that have their own police forces. The Ministry has reported back to the TB/MBC in its 2014/15 Results-based Planning that the cost of basic OPP policing services that support other municipal police services, such as for crime prevention, emergency response and filling in when local municipal police officers call in sick, is estimated

at \$4.1 million annually for the years ending March 31, 2015, 2016 and 2017. On June 25, 2014, the TB/MBC approved implementing cost recovery from municipal police services for the provision of basic OPP services. In addition, the OPP was to submit at a later date a proposal for recovering an estimated additional \$7.9 million for providing specialized services, such as canine units, to certain municipal police services.

## Use of Vehicles

### Recommendation 8

*To help adequately manage and control the use of vehicles, the Ontario Provincial Police should:*

- *improve its record-keeping and other processes for tracking inventory and assigning vehicles and capturing personal-use mileage; and*
- *ensure that its processes result in compliance with tax laws that require that any significant personal use of vehicles be reported as a taxable benefit to the employee.*

**Status: Fully implemented.**

**Status: Fully implemented.**

### Details

As of June 25, 2013, the OPP's Fleet, Supply and Weapons Services Bureau transitioned to a private service provider's web-based Garage Management System for assigning vehicles, monitoring locations and looking after vehicle manufacturer recalls. The private service provider, which is a vendor of record for the Ontario government, was already being used by the OPP to manage payments for maintenance, fuel and repairs for the fleet. A quarterly fleet vehicle reconciliation process was established in July 2013 that verifies the physical location of each fleet asset. The first quarterly reconciliation was completed in November 2013. Results of the reconciliation showed that out of a total fleet of 4,807 units, only the whereabouts of two small trailers could not be determined. These trailers have since been located.

In January 2013, the OPP changed its policy, and all employees with an assigned vehicle are now required to report their mileage through the taxable benefits mileage reporting system on the private service provider's website. The OPP has established new guidelines for employees' use and reporting of their personal use of OPP vehicles. The system can produce reports to allow the OPP to track the number of drivers assigned to vehicles and their reporting of personal mileage. The private service provider calculates the amount of taxable benefit and provides a record to the OPP for inclusion on employees' T4 slips.

## Detachment Inspections

### Recommendation 9

*To ensure that detachments meet legislative and policy requirements for ensuring the security and integrity of seized cash, drugs and firearms, and detachment weapons, the Ontario Provincial Police should:*

- *reassess its quality assurance processes and increase senior management oversight of results to identify ways to make inspections more effective, including the periodic use of surprise inspections to promote sustainable compliance; and*

**Status: Fully implemented.**

- *make detachment commanders more accountable for ensuring that actions have been taken to correct any deficiencies noted.*

**Status: Fully implemented.**

### Details

Since spring 2014, the OPP has made changes to require reports from on-site detachment inspections carried out by its Quality Assurance Unit to include responses from detachment commanders about how they achieved compliance or why they did not, as well as any follow-up actions planned to address deficiencies. This change facilitates oversight by senior management, which requests further corrective action should the results and action planned be deemed unsatisfactory. When

an inspection is completed, it is provided to the Provincial Commander Corporate Services and all deputy commissioners. The first provincial summary of detachment inspections is to be issued in January 2015.

Senior management also see the results of the Management Inspection Program, which is a self-assessment questionnaire completed by each detachment commander three times a year on whether the detachment is meeting the standards of the *Police Service Act* and the OPP's own policies, known as Police Orders. A summary term report and an annual summary report is forwarded to the Provincial Commanders of the OPP. Detachments are periodically checked for the accuracy of responses through the on-site detachment inspection process, typically every two to three years.

In February 2012, Police Orders were updated to include a mandatory requirement for each detachment to conduct a comprehensive audit of all vaults that hold seized firearms, drugs and cash during each calendar year. Detachments reconcile all the physical property in the vaults to the Records Management System to identify discrepancies. In addition, all vault officers are required to undertake new mandatory vault management training.

The OPP advised us that it does not support the use of surprise inspections of detachments, unless there are extraordinary circumstances.

## Effective Policing

### Recommendation 10

*To help ensure that police resources are focused on the Ontario Provincial Police's key objectives for effective policing, the Ontario Provincial Police should:*

- *improve the reporting to management on the community-oriented policing program and the results-driven policing program, and establish measures for assessing the effectiveness of these programs at individual detachments; and*

**Status: In the process of being implemented.**

- *monitor average officer response times to calls for service for each detachment to ensure that adequate response times are achieved, particularly for higher-priority calls and during peak demand periods.*

**Status: Will not be implemented. (We continue to believe this is an important and valid recommendation.)**

### Details

The OPP is continuing to implement its new community-policing model, the Mobilization and Engagement Model of Community Policing, which was introduced in 2010. The model includes regular meetings and communications between a committee of local citizens and members of the local detachment, during which the group would deal with local concerns about such issues as crime and traffic. The goal of the model is to improve community safety and to involve the community in crime prevention.

The Detachment Commander Advisory Committee, an informal advisory committee consisting of the detachment commanders from each of the five regional headquarters and the Highway Safety Division, has been established to guide the implementation of the model. The first meeting was held in October 2013 and the committee meets quarterly. Since 2010, however, the OPP still has not initiated any action to develop measures to assess the effectiveness of the program and processes to capture and report results.

In spring 2014, the OPP's Crime Prevention Section developed a Community Mobilization Planning template to support detachment commanders in identifying priorities, establishing partnerships in the communities and developing action plans. Detachment commanders are being asked to complete templates for issues identified, action taken and results so that they can be reviewed and shared to develop an inventory of case studies of best practices. As of September 30, 2014, seven case studies had been received. The OPP has provided detachments with training and supporting

information on its intranet, and was developing a training video to be available by December 2014.

We were advised that the community-policing model has been implemented throughout the province at each detachment. The OPP was planning to conduct a survey to assess the knowledge and implementation of the model in autumn 2015.

The OPP's Results-Driven Policing Accountability Framework is designed to improve community safety through targeted crime and traffic-enforcement initiatives. Using the framework, detachments and regional headquarters collect and analyze statistics on rates of certain crimes and the numbers of road-related fatalities and injuries, and target police resources to address problem areas. The OPP advised us that it has not established targets for detachments to measure their results and compare them with other detachments, and said the framework is used for identifying and responding to issues quickly, rather than as a benchmark to compare detachments and regions. The success of the program continues to be assessed at monthly and quarterly regional meetings, where results are compared with previous periods for individual detachments. A province-wide evaluation of the use of the Results-Driven Policing Accountability Framework was underway as of June 30, 2014, and was expected to evaluate its effectiveness, determine whether program objectives were being met, establish the most effective means of using and sharing data, and provide recommendations for short-, medium- and long-term strategies. A report to senior management was expected in fall 2014.

In our 2012 audit report, we noted that the OPP did not monitor response times, such as the time from when a call is received by one of its regional communications centres and when an officer arrives on the scene. While in our 2012 report we noted that the OPP had compiled an informal sample of average response times for one regional communication centre in 2011, it has not taken any further action to monitor response times. We were advised that the OPP continues to believe that monitoring response times and possibly establishing

targets is problematic, due to significant geographic differences among detachment areas across the province. In addition, the OPP noted that monitoring response times is not a current function of its computer-aided dispatch system. We disagree with the OPP, since the timely response to calls for service is imperative for police services, and senior managers should monitor this to ensure that an acceptable level of service is provided.

## Information Systems

### Recommendation 11

*To help ensure that its two key information systems contain accurate information that can be reliably used for managing and reporting on its policing activities and on crime and traffic occurrences, the Ontario Provincial Police should:*

- *assess the extent to which the Records Management System and Daily Activity Reporting systems do not reconcile with each other for critical data such as occurrences and calls for services;*  
**Status: Will not be implemented. (We continue to believe this is an important and valid recommendation.)**
- *consider whether periodic supervisory approval of officers' daily or weekly data input would help minimize inconsistent and inaccurate data between the two systems; and*  
**Status: Will not be implemented. (We continue to believe this is an important and valid recommendation.)**
- *on a longer-term basis, assess the cost/benefit of system changes that would enable officers to enter information such as occurrences and calls for service only once to update both systems.*  
**Status: In the process of being implemented.**

### Details

In our 2012 audit, we noted significant discrepancies between the Records Management System (RMS) and Daily Activity Reporting (DAR) systems,

both of which are used by officers on a daily basis to record their activities. For instance, there were 635,000 calls for service in the DAR for 2011 and approximately 815,000 occurrences reported in the RMS. The RMS tracks occurrences, such as those resulting from calls for service, and permits analysis of case-related information, such as types of crime committed, location, people and property involved, witness statements and officers' notes. Officers are required to update the RMS after each occurrence. The DAR is, primarily, a time-accounting system that tracks an officer's regular and overtime work hours, the number and types of calls for service to which an officer responds, and how much time each officer spends on activities such as traffic patrol, investigations and administration. Officers are required to update the DAR daily. The general view among the officers we spoke to for our 2012 audit was that the occurrences data from the RMS was more reliable than the calls-for-service data in the DAR; however, it is the DAR data that is published in the OPP's annual reports and used for staffing deployment models. At the time of our audit follow-up, the OPP had neither addressed the differences we noted in our 2012 audit report nor put in place plans to reconcile the information between the two databases. As a result, the OPP has increased its risk with respect to the accuracy and reliability of its published information, and the usefulness of its activity-based information for decision-making.

The OPP advised us that it had decided not to establish a new requirement that supervisors periodically approve officers' daily or weekly data input, to ensure greater accuracy, since it would be a time-consuming process for supervisory resources that are already fully tasked. The OPP plans to continue its practice of requiring supervisor approval when officers record overtime hours and to ensure weekly that officers have updated the DAR, but they do not check or approve the officer's data entries. The OPP noted that it recently expanded the use of civilian staff to enter data for officers into the RMS and this should result in improved data entry because the civilian staff is directly supervised.

The DAR, which was developed in-house, was implemented in 2000. In July 2012, the OPP approved a project to update or replace the DAR during the period from 2014 to 2016 to meet current and future OPP requirements. The RMS that was purchased in 2000 from a vendor is currently used by the OPP and more than 100 other police services. The OPP advised us that it plans, depending on the technical difficulty, to link the DAR and RMS systems so officers will not have to enter data twice.

## Performance Measurement and Reporting

### Recommendation 12

*While the Ontario Provincial Police provides good information on crime rates and its activities and services, additional information to enable the public to assess its cost effectiveness and operational efficiency is needed.*

**Status: Little or no progress.**

*It should also periodically and independently survey community residents who have had recent contact with the force to determine their satisfaction with the service they received.*

**Status: Fully implemented.**

### Details

In its 2012 annual report, the OPP for the first time included information on its costs for providing municipal police services on both an average per capita basis and a per household basis. However, the OPP still does not report information that would help assess its efficiency in all activities. For example, it does not report actual results and targets for the average times its communications centre takes to respond to emergency calls; officers' time lost due to illness; and the time its officers spend on calls for service and administrative duties. The OPP advised us that efficiency measures and targets are not published in its annual report because that is not required by legislation.

The results of the OPP's annual Provincial Community Satisfaction Survey were posted on its website for the first time after the 2012 survey. The 2013 Provincial Community Satisfaction Survey included responses to several questions specific to residents who had contact with the OPP over the last year for such things as motor vehicle collisions or traffic stops, property crime or violent crime incidents. The OPP advised us the 2015 survey will allow respondents who were dissatisfied with their contact with the OPP to provide an explanation of their concern.